2019-08-08: Moving Beyond Honors: Pass-Fail Grading for the Clinical Years

The following links were shared during the chat:

- Can We Build a Better Mousetrap? Improving the Measures of Practice Performance in the Field Practicum
- Growth Mindset https://www.mindsetworks.com/science/
- The Case for Transitioning to Pass-Fail Grading on Psychiatry Clerkships
  https://researchexperts.utmb.edu/en/publications/the-case-for-transitioning-to-passfail-grading-on-psychiatry-clerk
- Rater-based Assessments as Social Judgments: Rethinking the Etiology of Rater Errors
- Is it Appropriate to Use Core Clerkship Grades in the Selection of Residents?

MedEd Chat @MedEdChat 9 hours ago
Welcome to the #mededchat (US) I am your moderator for the next hour @alliance4clined #meded

MedEd Chat @MedEdChat 9 hours ago
The #mededchat topic & questions will be announced in a moment…for now, please introduce yourselves #meded

Kristina Dzara, PhD, MMSc @kristinadzara 9 hours ago
Kristina here checking in for #mededchat in between pug cuddles and celebrating my birthday! @DrSinhaEsq @hur2buzy @GLBDallaghan@myheroistrane #MedEd https://t.co/T9oSV3wZGG

Kristina Dzara, PhD, MMSc @kristinadzara 9 hours ago
RT @MedEdChat: Welcome to the #mededchat (US) I am your moderator for the next hour @alliance4clined #meded

Kristina Dzara, PhD, MMSc @kristinadzara 9 hours ago
RT @MedEdChat: The #mededchat topic & questions will be announced in a moment…for now, please introduce yourselves #meded

Gary Beck Dallaghan @GLBDallaghan 9 hours ago
@kristinadzara @DrSinhaEsq @hur2buzy @myheroistrane HAPPY BIRTHDAY!!!!!!! #mededchat #meded

Gary Beck Dallaghan @GLBDallaghan 9 hours ago
@MedEdChat Gary here in North Carolina #mededchat #meded

Kristina Dzara, PhD, MMSc @kristinadzara 9 hours ago
@GLBDallaghan @DrSinhaEsq @hur2buzy @myheroistrane Thank you @GLBDallaghan #MedEdChat
If you are tuning in to the #mededchat, remember to use the #mededchat hashtag and try to answer with the Topic numbers (T1, T2, T3)

RT @kristinadzara: If you are tuning in to the #mededchat, remember to use the #mededchat hashtag and try to answer with the Topic numbers (T1,...

RT @GLBDallaghan: @MedEdChat Gary here in North Carolina #mededchat #meded

We will assume that all of your tweets during #mededchat are your own during this hour unless otherwise stated #meded

Topic 1: What benefits are there for #medstudents to be completely pass/fail? #mededchat #meded

RT @MedEdChat: Topic 1: What benefits are there for #medstudents to be completely pass/fail? #mededchat #meded

T1 Pass-fail would allow #medstudents to focus on learning and learning from mistakes #mededchat #meded

#MedEdChat @GLBDallaghan T1: Less competition, less pressure, more peer to peer learning, more sharing of learning resources, and overall a safer space to learn. #MedEd

RT @GLBDallaghan: T1 Pass-fail would allow #medstudents to focus on learning and learning from mistakes #mededchat #meded

RT @kristinadzara: #MedEdChat @GLBDallaghan T1: Less competition, less pressure, more peer to peer learning, more sharing of learning reso...

T1 Decreased stress, improved wellness for students. #mededchat
Sateesh Arja, MD, MPH @ArjaSateesh 9 hours ago
@MedEdChat #mededchat T1 pass/fail might promote collaborative behaviors rather than competitive behaviors. Collaborative attitudes are very much required as a member of healthcare team #meded

Sateesh Arja, MD, MPH @ArjaSateesh 9 hours ago
RT @kristinadzara: #MedEdChat @GLBDallaghan T1: Less competition, less pressure, more peer to peer learning, more sharing of learning reso...

Alliance4ClinEd @Alliance4ClinEd 9 hours ago
RT @kristinadzara: #MedEdChat @GLBDallaghan T1: Less competition, less pressure, more peer to peer learning, more sharing of learning reso...

Kristina Dzara, PhD, MMSc @kristinadzara 9 hours ago
RT @ArjaSateesh: @MedEdChat #mededchat T1 pass/fail might promote collaborative behaviors rather than competitive behaviors. Collaborative...

Kristina Dzara, PhD, MMSc @kristinadzara 9 hours ago
RT @DavidACohen_MD: @MedEdChat T1 Decreased stress, improved wellness for students. #mededchat

Kristina Dzara, PhD, MMSc @kristinadzara 9 hours ago
@DavidACohen_MD @MedEdChat Agree but the real test would be to try and measure this. #MedEdChat

MedEd Chat @MedEdChat 9 hours ago
@DavidACohen_MD T1 How do you think pass-fail would improve wellness? If they still have a subject exam at the end, wouldn't that still elicit some anxiety, stress, and unwellness? #mededchat #meded

Sateesh Arja, MD, MPH @ArjaSateesh 9 hours ago
@DavidACohen_MD @MedEdChat #mededchat T1 agree. competition to reach the level of excellence is always good. #meded

MedEd Chat @MedEdChat 9 hours ago
#mededchat #meded

MedEdBot @MedEdBot 9 hours ago
RT @MedEdChat: Topic 1: What benefits are there for #medstudents to be completely pass/fail? #mededchat #meded
RT @GLBDallaghan: T1 Pass-fail would allow #medstudents to focus on learning and learning from mistakes #mededchat #meded

RT @kristinadzara: #MedEdChat @GLBDallaghan T1: Less competition, less pressure, more peer to peer learning, more sharing of learning reso...

RT @MedEdChat: #mededchat #meded https://t.co/w4gC7bw7SA

Tension between collaborative and competitive mindset in terms of whether students embrace or reject pass-fail. Need to help foster understanding of benefits and advocate to #MakeUSMLEPassFail, too. #mededchat

There is also intrinsic motivation. #MedEdChat

RT @myheroistrane: Tension between collaborative and competitive mindset in terms of whether students embrace or reject pass-fail. Need to...

Absolutely. If there was a test for intrinsic motivation, I bet that would be a better predictor if success as an physician than MCATs or Step 1. #MedEdChat #MedEd

T1- seems likely it would encourage students to fully adopt growth mindset rather than self-protection. Assessment for learning rather than assessment of learning. #mededchat https://t.co/O5ALwXc93I

You may well be on to something @DavidACohen_MD #MedEdChat

Agree. At this point in career, students start to realize that their knowledge is directly applicable to patients. That matters more than beating others on tests. #mededchat
Gary Beck Dallaghan @GLBDallaghan 9 hours ago
@myheroistrane T1 #medstudents know the grading in clerkships is flawed. This report hits that point home even harder https://t.co/r9yLjCz54S #mededchat #meded

Kristina Dzara, PhD, MMSc @kristinadzara 9 hours ago
RT @MedEdChat: @DavidACohen_MD T1 How do you think pass-fail would improve wellness? If they still have a subject exam at the end, wouldn’t…

ShereeseM, MS/MBA @ShereesePubHlth9 hours ago
RT @MedEdChat: Topic 1: What benefits are there for #medstudents to be completely pass/fail? #mededchat #meded

MedEd Chat @MedEdChat 9 hours ago
RT @elewMD: @kristinadzara @ArjaSateesh @DavidACohen_MD @MedEdChat Agree. At this point in career, students start to realize that their kno…

ShereeseM, MS/MBA @ShereesePubHlth9 hours ago
@MedEdChat @lorenlas1 Thoughts? #mededchat #meded

John Lowry PhD @DrJohn58859 hours ago
@MedEdChat T1: Pass/fail would create as many issues as it would solve. Best to use it strategically. Perhaps with #step1 potentially moving to pass/fail, this can be modeled in #MedEd up to that point in the curriculum. #MedEdChat

MedEd Chat @MedEdChat 9 hours ago
RT @mmteacherdoc: T1- seems likely it would encourage students to fully adopt growth mindset rather than self-protection. Assessment for lea…

Ana Felix @anacfelix 9 hours ago
RT @GLBDallaghan: @myheroistrane T1 #medstudents know the grading in clerkships is flawed. This report hits that point home even harder ht…

Kristina Dzara, PhD, MMSc @kristinadzara 9 hours ago
RT @MedEdChat: Topic 1: What benefits are there for #medstudents to be completely pass/fail? #mededchat #meded

MedEd Chat @MedEdChat 9 hours ago
Topic 2: What unintended consequences might emerge from a completely pass/fail framework? #mededchat #meded

Kristina Dzara, PhD, MMSc @kristinadzara 9 hours ago
RT @DavidACohen_MD: @kristinadzara @ArjaSateesh @MedEdChat Absolutely. If there was a test for intrinsic motivation, I bet that would be…
Marty Muntz @mmteacherdoc 9 hours ago
T1- agree with others who have said “improve wellness” - but I worry that we use wellness & burnout so often that terms are less impactful to hear now. How about decrease depression, anxiety, and suicide. #mededchat

MedEd Chat @MedEdChat 8 hours ago
@DrJohn5885 T2 You alluded to this....but what are some of the issues you perceive would emerge from a pass-fail framework on the clerkship? #mededchat #meded

Paul Haidet @myheroistrane 8 hours ago
@GLBDallaghan https://t.co/H8r0UY2G1t #mededchat

Kristina Dzara, PhD, MMSc @kristinadzara 8 hours ago
@elewMD @ArjaSateesh @DavidACohen_MD @MedEdChat But many are still focused on grades, and passing. Fear of failure is very anxiety provoking. #MedEdChat

edward lew @elewMD 8 hours ago
@MedEdChat There's a largest onus on residency selection committees to evaluate hundreds and hundreds of apps individually rather than using simple cutoffs. More time consuming to say the least #mededchat

MedEd Chat @MedEdChat 8 hours ago
RT @myheroistrane: @GLBDallaghan https://t.co/H8r0UY2G1t #mededchat

David A. Cohen @DavidACohen_MD 8 hours ago
@kristinadzara @elewMD @ArjaSateesh @MedEdChat Not to mention that these wicked smart future doctors got to where they are by getting great grades. And many of them thrive (or even rely) on them for a sense of mental well-being. #mededchat #MedEd

Marty Muntz @mmteacherdoc 8 hours ago
@elewMD @kristinadzara @ArjaSateesh @DavidACohen_MD @MedEdChat Agree - if only residency matches didn’t depend so much on exam performance. #mededchat

Dr. Jennifer Chen, MD FAAP @DrJenChen4kids 8 hours ago
@MedEdChat #mededchat T1: Agree at least preclinical courses and USMLE steps should be P/F to cutthroat competition, but medstudents will inevitably jostle for other distinguishing things like research/leadership positions so there will always be competition

David A. Cohen @DavidACohen_MD 8 hours ago
@mmteacherdoc @elewMD @kristinadzara @ArjaSateesh @MedEdChat THAT is something that we can do something about. #mededchat
Agree - if only residency matches didn’t depend so much on…

Interesting thought. But there are studies showing that clerkship grades are not indicative of residency performance. [link]

Only very intrinsically motivated students thrive. Does not provide enough extrinsic motivation for the rest.

T2 learners might lose the motivation to reach the standard of excellence or honors or whatever. They might get satisfied with minimum competency just to reach the pass level.

RT: Topic 2: What unintended consequences might emerge from a completely pass/fail framework?

T2 if going pass/fail, need to set the pass bar high, and allow variable time to get to passing, with a culture that frames failure as a learning opportunity on the way to eventually passing.

I hear this argument a lot. Do you really think highly driven people who got into medical school will not continue to strive to be the best they can be simply because of a pass-fail grade?

Agree w @elewMD re: making it harder for residency PDs. I also worry some students would just work enough “to get by” in clerkships, which, to be fair, already happens sometimes for students who care less about a particular specialty.

Interesting thought. But there are studies showing that clerkship grades are not indicative of…

It’s true…but wouldn’t it be great if there were ways to narrow it down that actually meaningfully predicted how good of a resident and doctor an applicant might be?
Having graduated from a pass/fail medical school, the answer is yes. 

T2 yes there is a possibility. Motivation, communication skills, and professional behaviors are not stable attitudes. They change.

Right. I taught a healthcare research course to undergrad health sciences majors. They were floored that there would be no tests.

Anxiety abound for about a month until they realized they were learning by reading, thinking, presenting. Grades became less important when they all realized they were doing well - and learning as we as understanding research.

That's sad to hear.

Fair, but the article also points out there is so much variability across schools' clerkship grading that it kind of makes the current system(s) less meaningful

RT @mmteacherdoc: T1- agree with others who have said “improve wellness” - but I worry that we use wellness & burnout so often that terms a…

Yes, maybe quartiles instead of scores. Still helps to narrow down, while somewhat decreasing stress for the students.

Sounds like you believe in the promise of #CBME

So much fun stuff to chat about in this topic. Like how much of the clerkship grade differentiation is based on the NBME subject exam (usually a lot). And the difference among grading procedures across schools.
Kristina Dzara, PhD, MMSc @kristinadzara 8 hours ago
RT @mmteacherdoc: @GLBDallaghan @DrJenChen4kids @MedEdChat So much fun stuff to chat about in this topic. Like how much of the clerkship gr…

Paul Haidet @myheroistrane 8 hours ago
@GLBDallaghan @DrSinhaEsq @ArjaSateesh @MedEdChat This is why making that pass bar high is so important. Most should not pass on the first try, but should be able and supported to get there with work. First rule of deliberate practice: the task should be difficult but attainable. #mededchat

Paul Haidet @myheroistrane 8 hours ago
@kristinadzara Yes, AND... we have a long way to go! #mededchat

Gary Beck Dallaghan @GLBDallaghan 8 hours ago
@DrJenChen4kids @MedEdChat It does. Which truly raises the question about the relevance of tiered-grading, particularly if it creates an unhealthy learning environment #mededchat #meded

Kristina Dzara, PhD, MMSc @kristinadzara 8 hours ago
RT @myheroistrane: @GLBDallaghan @DrSinhaEsq @ArjaSateesh @MedEdChat This is why making that pass bar high is so important. Most should not…

MedEd Chat @MedEdChat 8 hours ago
RT potentially felonious physician @croyce62 absolutely. We have seen an increase in shelf failures and (again anecdotally) I have heard rumors from students that the best strategy is to study just enough to pass the shelf and no more! #mededchat #meded

Marty Muntz @mmteacherdoc 8 hours ago
@hughseejay The counterpoint to this that current extrinsic motivators (specifically USMLE, grades) compel our students to spend less time with patients and care teams learning, you know, how to be an excellent doctor. #mededchat

Deb Simpson @debsimpson38 8 hours ago
T2 #mededchat Pass/Fail is an "extrinsic" motivator - per discussion. Let’s consider how does growth vs fixed mindset can be rewarded as goal is not a physician who “passes” but one driven by intrinsic factors. https://t.co/L2vhQs8QXm

MedEd Chat @MedEdChat 8 hours ago
RT @mmteacherdoc: @hughseejay The counterpoint to this that current extrinsic motivators (specifically USMLE, grades) compel our students t…

MedEd Chat @MedEdChat 8 hours ago
Topic 3: What could be done to foster comparability in clinical grading across institutions? #mededchat #meded
Marty Muntz @mmteacherdoc 8 hours ago
Hey everyone- Marty from @MedicalCollege of WI in Milwaukee. Cheating on #mededchat with #PrimaryCareChat

Gary Beck Dallaghan @GLBDallaghan 8 hours ago
T3 Given rater variability noted in several publications, this is a good question. https://t.co/rqhHfbmkTR #mededchat #meded

MedEd Chat @MedEdChat 8 hours ago
RT @GLBDallaghan: T3 Given rater variability noted in several publications, this is a good question. https://t.co/rqhHfbmkTR #mededchat #me...

Deb Simpson @debsimpson38 8 hours ago
T2 #mededchat pass/fail - to see intrinsic motivation at work - consider the early match for peds students and how that positively changed the dynamic of learning (not tests) and teacher/learner relationships focused on competence and #Growth https://t.co/Dl2UeKxdb6

edward lew @elewMD8 hours ago
@MedEdChat T3: we have to stop grade inflation. Not sure how. We’ve made this a point in EM, but still seeing a lot of it #MedEdchat

MedEd Chat @MedEdChat 8 hours ago
RT @debsimpson3: T2 #mededchat pass/fail - to see intrinsic motivation at work - consider the early match for peds students and how that po...

Alliance4ClinEd @Alliance4ClinEd8 hours ago
T3 Do we think using a framework like the core EPAs for entering residency will help? #mededchat #meded

ShereeseM, MS/MBA @ShereesePubHlth8 hours ago
RT @MedEdChat: Topic 3: What could be done to foster comparability in clinical grading across institutions? #mededchat #meded

Dr. Jennifer Chen, MD FAAP @DrJenChen4kids8 hours ago
@MedEdChat #MedEdChat T3: That’s reeeally tough...obviously grading varies nationally among HS and colleges too! Maybe guidelines saying something like “shelf exam score should count toward no more than 25% of grade…” which could be specialty-specific if needed

Paul Haidet @myheroistrane8 hours ago
@MedEdChat If it involves a “nonprofit” company making millions of dollars, continually bringing and promoting new “products” to the assessment “market”, and its CEO insinuating that students forego studying to update their Instagram accounts, count me out. #MedEdchat#makeUSMLEPassFail
Kristina Dzara, PhD, MMSc @kristinadzara 8 hours ago
RT @MedEdChat: Topic 3: What could be done to foster comparability in clinical grading across institutions? #mededchat #meded

Kristina Dzara, PhD, MMSc @kristinadzara 8 hours ago
RT @GLBDallaghan: @DrJenChen4kids @MedEdChat Interesting thought. But there are studies showing that clerkship grades are not indicative of...

Marty Muntz @mmteacherdoc 8 hours ago
@hughseejay Maybe. But eventually don’t get grades. Can’t we flip the switch sooner than day 1 of residency? #mededchat

Kristina Dzara, PhD, MMSc @kristinadzara 8 hours ago
RT @Alliance4ClinEd: T3 Do we think using a framework like the core EPAs for entering residency will help? #mededchat #meded

MedEd Chat @MedEdChat 8 hours ago
RT @DrJenChen4kids: @MedEdChat #MedEdChat T3: That’s reeeally tough...obviously grading varies nationally among HS and colleges too! Maybe...

Paul Haidet @myheroistrane 8 hours ago
@andrewdluo It’s just a dream, but I would see a series of triple-jumps with demonstration of excellent critical thinking skills in the face of novel problems in order to pass the internal medicine clerkship. #MedEdchat

COMSEP @COMSEPediatrics 8 hours ago
RT @MedEdChat: Topic 3: What could be done to foster comparability in clinical grading across institutions? #mededchat #meded

COMSEP @COMSEPediatrics 8 hours ago
RT @Alliance4ClinEd: T3 Do we think using a framework like the core EPAs for entering residency will help? #mededchat #meded

Ryan K Harrison, MD @rkh_md 8 hours ago
@MedEdChat #MedEdChat T3: Not only does grading vary - but so do curricula or locations of rotations. When I went to school, you could do surgery at the medical center or in private practice setting - the grading between the two was VERY different.

COMSEP @COMSEPediatrics 8 hours ago
RT @kristinadzara: #MedEdChat @GLBDallaghan T1: Less competition, less pressure, more peer to peer learning, more sharing of learning reso…
Gary Beck Dallaghan @GLBDallaghan 8 hours ago
@rkh_md @MedEdChat Would it be better to use narrative comments about performance as a means of constructing a grade? @JaniceEducation did this in Colorado and it appears to be a much more accurate reflection of student performance. #mededchat #meded

Paul Haidet @myheroistrane 8 hours ago
@MedEdChat If it involves a whole bunch of for-profit companies charging debt-burdened medical students for a product that they miss class to use based on the promise of excelling on the gatekeeper test (which does not predict clinical excellence), count me out. #MedEdchat

MedEd Chat @MedEdChat 8 hours ago
We have about 5 more minutes left in our discussion. Please feel free to give some final thoughts #meded #mededchat

Marty Muntz @mmteacherdoc 8 hours ago
RT @myheroistrane: @MedEdChat If it involves a whole bunch of for-profit companies charging debt-burdened medical students for a product that they miss class to use based on the promise of excelling on the gatekeeper test (which does not predict clinical excellence), count me out. #MedEdchat

Marty Muntz @mmteacherdoc 8 hours ago
RT @myheroistrane: @MedEdChat If it involves a “nonprofit” company making millions of dollars, continually bringing and promoting new “prod…

Kristina Dzara, PhD, MMSc @kristinadzara 8 hours ago
RT @MedEdChat: We have about 5 more minutes left in our discussion. Please feel free to give some final thoughts #meded #mededchat

Marty Muntz @mmteacherdoc 8 hours ago
RT @debsimpson3: T2 #mededchat pass/fail - to see intrinsic motivation at work - consider the early match for peds students and how that po…

Alliance4ClinEd @Alliance4ClinEd 8 hours ago
Interesting discussion of +/- of pass-fail frameworks on the clerkships. Seems there are still a lot of external influences to maintain tiered-grading for now #mededchat #meded

Paul Haidet @myheroistrane 8 hours ago
@MedEdChat If it involves the economics and culture of medical education creating critical shortages of physicians in specialties central to the health of the public, count me out. #MedEdchat

MedEd Chat @MedEdChat 8 hours ago
Join us again next week at 9 pm Thursday. Don’t forget to suggest topics by DM or email #meded #mededchat
MedEd Chat @MedEdChat 8 hours ago
That's a wrap...I will post the #mededchat transcript tomorrow morning on https://t.co/mJivoKroXx on the Resources page. Thanks everyone for participating! #meded

Marty Muntz @mmteacherdoc 8 hours ago
T3- pie in the sky? It’s going to take trust & collaboration and willingness to put the best interest of students & patients above other drivers. UME and GME. Across schools. #mededchat https://t.co/Xcvkd0CyZ5

Teresa Hartman @thartman2u 8 hours ago
RT @MedEdChat: That's a wrap...I will post the #mededchat transcript tomorrow morning on https://t.co/mJivoKroXx on the Resources page. Tha…

Teresa Hartman @thartman2u 8 hours ago
RT @myheroistrane: @andrewdluo It’s just a dream, but I would see a series of triple-jumps with demonstration of excellent critical thinkin…

Sateesh Arja, MD, MPH @ArjaSateesh 3 hours ago
RT @ArjaSateesh: @GLBDallaghan @MedEdChat #mededchat T2 yes there is a possibility. Motivation, communication skills, and professional beha…

Sateesh Arja, MD, MPH @ArjaSateesh 3 hours ago
RT @ArjaSateesh: @MedEdChat @mededchat T2 learners might loose the motivation to reach the standard of excellence or honors or whatever. Th…

Sateesh Arja, MD, MPH @ArjaSateesh 3 hours ago
RT @ArjaSateesh: @DavidACohen_MD @MedEdChat #mededchat T1 agree. competition to reach the level of excellence is always good. #meded

Sateesh Arja, MD, MPH @ArjaSateesh 3 hours ago
RT @ArjaSateesh: @MedEdChat #mededchat T1 pass/fail might promote collaborative behaviors rather than competitive behaviors. Collaborative…

Kate King @DrKate_King an hour ago
This is useful for educators facilitating groups too. Be aware of the gender differences in groups and manage the contributions so that everyone is heard. #MedEdchat #meded

Kay Hallsworth @kay_hallsworth 18 minutes ago
RT @DrKate_King: This is useful for educators facilitating groups too. Be aware of the gender differences in groups and manage the contribu…
The #MedEdChat Influencers

Top 10 by Mentions

@MedEdChat 68
@GLBDallaghan 25
@ArjaSateesh 21
@DavidACohen_MD 17
@kristinadzara 15
@myheroistrane 12
@elewMD 11
@DrJenChen4kids 7
@mmteacherdoc 7
@DrSinhaEsq 6

Top 10 by Tweets

@kristinadzara 29
@MedEdChat 24
@mmteacherdoc 12
@GLBDallaghan 10
@ArjaSateesh 9
@myheroistrane 9
@DavidACohen_MD 5
@MedEdBot 4
@DrJenChen4kids 4
@ShereesePubHlth 3

Top 10 by Impressions
@MedEdChat 171.4K
@kristinadzara 118.8K
@ShereesePubHlth 54.0K
@mmteacherdoc 16.7K
@myheroistrane 12.0K
@GLBDallaghan 11.9K
@DavidACohen_MD 7.9K
@DrJenChen4kids 7.6K
@MedEdBot 4.9K
@DrSinhaEsq 3.6K